
Exploring resilience and trauma: a comparative analysis of 'The Comfort Book' and 'The Body Keeps the Score'

Explorando a resiliência e o trauma: uma análise comparativa de 'The Comfort Book' e 'The Body Keeps the Score'

Explorando la resiliencia y el trauma: un análisis comparativo de 'El libro del consuelo' y 'El cuerpo lleva la cuenta'

1 Kirolos Eskandar



[ORCID](#)

Affiliation of authors: 1 [Main affiliation Diakonie-Klinik Mosbach, Mosbach, Baden Württemberg, Germany, Function [Physician], <https://www.diakonie-klinik-mosbach.de/index.html>]

Chief Editor responsible for the article: Leonardo Baldaçara

Authors contributions according to the [Taxonomia CRediT](#):

Eskandar K [1-3,5-14]

Disclosure of potential conflicts of interest: none

Funding: none

Approval Research Ethics Committee (REC): not applicable

Received on: 10/08/2024

Accepted on: 22/08/2024

Published on: 02/09/2024

How to cite: Eskandar K. Exploring resilience and trauma: a comparative analysis of 'The Comfort Book' and 'The Body Keeps the Score'. Debates em Psiquiatria, Rio de Janeiro. 2024;14:1-8.

<https://doi.org/10.25118/2763-9037.2024.v14.1323>

ABSTRACT:

In the ever-evolving field of psychiatry, understanding the intricate relationship between mental health, trauma, and recovery remains crucial. Recent literature has offered profound insights into these connections, with

particular focus on how individuals navigate their mental health challenges. Two recent works—Matt Haig’s [The Comfort Book](#) (2021) and Bessel van der Kolk’s [The Body Keeps the Score](#) (2014) —have garnered significant attention for their distinct yet complementary approaches to addressing psychological well-being. While *The Comfort Book* provides a reflective, almost meditative guide to fostering resilience in everyday life, *The Body Keeps the Score* delves deeply into the neurological and physiological impacts of trauma, offering a more clinical yet accessible approach to understanding and treating psychological wounds. This comparative review aims to critically examine how these books contribute to the discourse on mental health, highlighting their relevance to both practitioners and patients in the field of psychiatry. These books, although different in style and scope, serve as valuable resources. They provide readers with practical tools and theoretical knowledge to better understand the complexities of trauma and resilience. The comparative analysis of these works will explore their effectiveness in enhancing our understanding of mental health, resilience, and the journey towards healing.

Keywords: mental health, resilience, trauma therapy, self-compassion, neuroplasticity, emotional support, psychiatry, trauma recovery, mind-body connection, personal reflection

RESUMO:

No campo em constante evolução da psiquiatria, a compreensão da intrincada relação entre saúde mental, trauma e recuperação continua a ser crucial. A literatura recente tem oferecido insights profundos sobre essas conexões, com foco particular em como os indivíduos enfrentam seus desafios de saúde mental. Dois trabalhos recentes – [The Comfort Book](#) (2021) de Matt Haig e [The Body Keeps the Score](#) (2014) de Bessel van der Kolk – atraíram atenção significativa pelas suas abordagens distintas, mas complementares, para abordar o bem-estar psicológico. Embora *The Comfort Book* forneça um guia reflexivo, quase meditativo, para promover a resiliência na vida cotidiana, *The Body Keeps the Score* investiga profundamente os impactos neurológicos e fisiológicos do trauma, oferecendo uma abordagem mais clínica, porém acessível, para compreender e tratar feridas psicológicas. Esta resenha comparativa tem como objetivo examinar criticamente como esses livros contribuem para o discurso sobre saúde mental, destacando sua relevância tanto para profissionais quanto para pacientes no campo da psiquiatria. Esses livros, embora diferentes em estilo e escopo, servem como recursos valiosos. Eles

forneem aos leitores ferramentas práticas e conhecimento teórico para compreender melhor as complexidades do trauma e da resiliência. A análise comparativa destes trabalhos explorará a sua eficácia na melhoria da nossa compreensão da saúde mental, da resiliência e da jornada rumo à cura.

Palavras-chave: saúde mental, resiliência, terapia de trauma, autocompaixão, neuroplasticidade, apoio emocional, psiquiatria, recuperação de trauma, conexão mente-corpo, reflexão pessoal

RESUMEN:

En el campo de la psiquiatría en constante evolución, comprender la intrincada relación entre la salud mental, el trauma y la recuperación sigue siendo crucial. La literatura reciente ha ofrecido conocimientos profundos sobre estas conexiones, con especial atención en cómo las personas enfrentan sus desafíos de salud mental. Dos trabajos recientes, [The Comfort Book](#) (2021) de Matt Haig y [The Body Keeps the Score](#) (2014) de Bessel van der Kolk, han atraído una atención significativa por sus enfoques distintos pero complementarios para abordar el bienestar psicológico. Mientras que *The Comfort Book* proporciona una guía reflexiva, casi meditativa, para fomentar la resiliencia en la vida cotidiana, *The Body Keeps the Score* profundiza en los impactos neurológicos y fisiológicos del trauma, ofreciendo un enfoque más clínico pero accesible para comprender y tratar las heridas psicológicas. Esta revisión comparativa tiene como objetivo examinar críticamente cómo estos libros contribuyen al discurso sobre la salud mental, destacando su relevancia tanto para los profesionales como para los pacientes en el campo de la psiquiatría. Estos libros, aunque diferentes en estilo y alcance, constituyen recursos valiosos. Proporcionan a los lectores herramientas prácticas y conocimientos teóricos para comprender mejor las complejidades del trauma y la resiliencia. El análisis comparativo de estos trabajos explorará su eficacia para mejorar nuestra comprensión de la salud mental, la resiliencia y el camino hacia la curación.

Palabras clave: salud mental, resiliencia, terapia de trauma, autocompasión, neuroplasticidad, apoyo emocional, psiquiatría, recuperación de trauma, conexión cuerpo-mente, reflexión personal

Introduction

In the ever-evolving field of psychiatry, understanding the intricate relationship between mental health, trauma, and recovery remains crucial. Recent literature has offered profound insights into these connections, with particular focus on how individuals navigate their mental health challenges. Two recent works—Matt Haig’s [The Comfort Book](#) (2021) and Bessel van der Kolk’s [The Body Keeps the Score](#) (2014) —have garnered significant attention for their distinct yet complementary approaches to addressing psychological well-being.

While *The Comfort Book* provides a reflective, almost meditative guide to fostering resilience in everyday life, *The Body Keeps the Score* delves deeply into the neurological and physiological impacts of trauma, offering a more clinical yet accessible approach to understanding and treating psychological wounds. This review aims to critically examine how these books contribute to the discourse on mental health, highlighting their relevance to both practitioners and patients in the field of psychiatry.

These books, although different in style and scope, serve as valuable resources. They provide readers with practical tools and theoretical knowledge to better understand the complexities of trauma and resilience. The comparative analysis of these works will explore their effectiveness in enhancing our understanding of mental health, resilience, and the journey towards healing.

Summary of the books

The comfort book by Matt Haig

Individual summary

The Comfort Book is a reflective and deeply personal collection of thoughts, anecdotes, and insights from Matt Haig, an author who has been open about his own struggles with mental health [1]. The book serves as a guide to finding comfort in difficult times, offering readers short, digestible entries that encourage self-compassion, resilience, and hope. Haig draws from his own experiences as well as philosophical musings and quotes from various sources to create a work that feels like a warm, reassuring conversation with a close friend. The book does not follow a traditional narrative structure but instead offers a series of reflections that readers can dip into whenever they need emotional support. The main argument centers on the idea that even in the darkest moments, there is always a glimmer of hope to hold onto, and that resilience can be cultivated through small, everyday acts of kindness towards oneself.

Key themes

1. Resilience: Haig emphasizes the importance of resilience in the face of life's challenges, suggesting that even the smallest acts of self-care can contribute to long-term mental well-being.
2. Self-Compassion: The book advocates for a gentle, non-judgmental approach to one's own mental health struggles, promoting the idea that it's okay not to be okay.
3. Hope: A central theme is the enduring presence of hope, even in the darkest times, and the importance of finding it in small, everyday moments.

The Body Keeps the Score by Bessel van der Kolk Individual summary

Bessel van der Kolk's *The Body Keeps the Score* is a seminal work in the field of trauma therapy, offering an in-depth exploration of how trauma affects the brain and body [2]. Drawing from decades of research and clinical experience, van der Kolk examines the physiological and neurological impacts of trauma, explaining how traumatic experiences can reshape both the mind and body. The book is structured to guide the reader through the science of trauma, including the roles of the limbic system, the prefrontal cortex, and the body's stress response. Van der Kolk also discusses various treatment approaches, such as EMDR, yoga, and neurofeedback, that can help trauma survivors heal. The book is richly detailed with case studies and research findings, making it a comprehensive resource for both professionals and those personally affected by trauma.

Key themes

1. Trauma and the Body: The book highlights the intricate connection between trauma and physical health, explaining how the body stores traumatic memories.
2. Neuroplasticity: Van der Kolk emphasizes the brain's ability to change and heal through targeted therapies, offering hope for recovery even after severe trauma.
3. Holistic Healing: The book advocates for a multifaceted approach to trauma therapy that includes physical, psychological, and emotional components.

Comparative analysis

Strengths and weaknesses

The Comfort Book excels in its accessibility and emotional resonance, making it an ideal companion for anyone needing immediate comfort. Its strength lies in its simplicity and the relatability of Haig's reflections. However, its lack of a structured approach might not appeal to readers looking for in-depth analysis or clinical guidance.

In contrast, *The Body Keeps the Score* offers a rigorous, research-based exploration of trauma, making it invaluable for professionals in psychiatry and psychology. Its strength is in its depth and the scientific grounding of its arguments. However, its detailed and technical content might be overwhelming for lay readers without a background in neuroscience or psychology.

Target Audience

The Comfort Book is best suited for a general audience, including those who are struggling with mental health issues and need quick, relatable insights. It's also a good fit for readers looking for a non-clinical approach to emotional well-being.

The Body Keeps the Score, on the other hand, is tailored more towards mental health professionals, students in psychiatry or psychology, and trauma survivors who are looking for a deeper understanding of how trauma affects the body and mind. Its detailed exploration of treatment methods also makes it a valuable resource for practitioners.

Complementary Nature

Despite their differences, *The Comfort Book* and *The Body Keeps the Score* can be seen as complementary works. *The Comfort Book* provides immediate, accessible emotional support, making it a useful resource for patients or readers who might be overwhelmed by the more clinical approach of *The Body Keeps the Score*. On the other hand, *The Body Keeps the Score* offers the scientific context and detailed treatment options that can inform a deeper understanding of the issues that Haig touches on in a more personal, anecdotal way. Together, these books offer both the comfort and the clinical insights necessary for a holistic approach to mental health and trauma recovery.

Critical evaluation

Analytical depth

The Comfort Book achieves its goal of providing immediate emotional support with simplicity and relatability. Its strength lies in its accessibility—Haig’s reflections are easy to digest and resonate with readers on a personal level. However, the book’s lack of structure and depth may limit its utility for those seeking more than just surface-level comfort. It excels as a tool for immediate reassurance but may fall short for readers who need a more in-depth exploration of mental health issues or practical strategies for long-term resilience.

On the other hand, *The Body Keeps the Score* is a meticulously researched and well-structured work that offers a comprehensive analysis of trauma's impact on both the mind and body. Van der Kolk succeeds in making complex scientific concepts accessible to a broad audience, including those without a background in neuroscience. The book’s analytical depth is one of its key strengths, providing readers with a thorough understanding of trauma and its treatment. However, the detailed and sometimes technical content may be challenging for lay readers, who might find the extensive scientific information overwhelming.

Personal Insights

From a professional standpoint, both books offer valuable contributions to the field of mental health, though they serve different purposes. The Comfort Book is particularly useful for patients or individuals who need immediate emotional relief. Its messages of hope and resilience align with therapeutic practices that emphasize self-compassion and mindfulness. However, as a psychiatrist, I find *The Body Keeps the Score* to be an indispensable resource. It provides a deep dive into the physiological and psychological mechanisms of trauma, offering insights that are directly applicable to clinical practice. The book’s exploration of various treatment modalities, including EMDR and neurofeedback, has broadened my understanding of trauma therapy and influenced my approach to patient care. The two books complement each other well, with Haig’s work offering a more personal, reflective approach to mental health, while van der Kolk’s book provides the scientific and clinical grounding necessary for effective treatment.

Conclusion

Overall, both *The Comfort Book* and *The Body Keeps the Score* are valuable resources for different audiences within the mental health field. I would highly recommend *The Comfort Book* to anyone in need of immediate emotional support or a gentle introduction to mental health topics, particularly those who may be overwhelmed by more technical literature. *The Body Keeps the Score*, on the other hand, is essential reading for mental health professionals, students, and individuals seeking a deeper understanding of trauma's impact on the body and mind. Together, these books offer a holistic view of mental health, making them a powerful combination for anyone interested in both the personal and clinical aspects of psychological well-being.

References

1. Haig M. [The comfort book](#): a hug in book form. Edinburgh: Canongate Books; 2021.
2. Van Der Kolk B. [The body keeps the score](#): brain, mind, and body in the healing of trauma. London: Penguin Books; 2015.